



Old West End Historic District Commission

MEETING Minutes for September 8, 2025

DATE: Monday, September 8, 2025
TIME: 5:30 p.m.
PLACE: Collingwood Presbyterian Church

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT

David Kosmyna, Neighborhood
Kathleen Kovacs, Neighborhood
Jim Roseland, Neighborhood
Kris Ball, Plan Commission
John Alvitre, Neighborhood
Bryan Latta, Neighborhood
Julie Apt, Special Interest

COMMISSION MEMBERS ABSENT

Diana Sluhan, Neighborhood

GUESTS

Pam Weirauch
Lucia Fitzgerald
Thelma Bowens
Preston Portales (Beal Properties)
Ed & Sandra House
Steve Steel
Helen Cooks
Judy Stone
Chuck Madrigal
Finley Gleason
Catherine Hernandez

STAFF

Bill Harbert, Associate Planner
Karyn Bercheni, Clerk Specialist II

AGENDA

Roll Call: 5:30 pm

Meeting Minutes

August 11, 2025 – Motion to Approve – Comm. Kovacs; Second – Comm. Alvitre.
Minutes Approved.

1. OWE-116-25: Install Aluminum Siding over Fascia Board

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Install Aluminum Siding over Existing Wood Fascia
Location	-	2115 Collingwood
Owner	-	Beal Properties LLC 2200 Commonwealth Blvd, Suite 2 Ann Arbor, MI 48105

Site Description

Zoning	-	RM36 / Multi Dwelling Residential
Frontage	-	75' on Collingwood
Use	-	Multi-Dwelling Residential
Year Built	-	1964

Parcel History

OWE-115-25	–	Replace Existing Asphalt Driveway (Admin Approved 9/2/25)
OWE-83-13	–	Change Sign Copy (Admin Approved 12/17/13)
OWE-42-10	–	New Sign (Comm Approved 9/13/10)
OWE-9-84	–	Fire Damage Repairs (Admin Approved 4/26/84)

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to install aluminum siding over existing wood fascia on the building located at 2115 Collingwood Blvd. The building was built in 1964 and has wood fascia located at the top of the building. Staff conducted a site visit and found the wood to be in the beginning stages of needing to be replaced. Aluminum siding is an inconsistent product within the historic district overlay and its use is discouraged in the newly adopted Old West End Historic District Guidelines.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§11.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to install aluminum siding over existing wood fascia at 2115 Collingwood, staff objects to the application as proposed due to the use of aluminum products within the overlay district.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission disapprove OWE-116-25, a request to install aluminum siding over existing wood fascia at 2115 Collingwood for the following reasons:

1. The proposed aluminum siding is inconsistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and would detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
2. The proposed aluminum siding is inconsistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines, which discourages the use of aluminum siding in the overlay.

Discussion: The applicant (Mr. Portales, representing Beal Properties) was present. Mr. Beal explained that they would like to replace the existing wood fascia board with aluminum siding. They are requesting approval for aluminum siding because it is a low-maintenance option. Comm. Kosmyna inquired about condition of the current fascia board, it is in good shape, but the paint is peeling. Comm. Apt inquired about what type of material they are requesting. The applicant has not picked the aluminum siding that they would like to use and was open to suggestion on material and color. The Commissioners explained that there is a wide variety of aluminum siding styles and they cannot give a blanket approval without an example/sample of

proposed material. Comm. Kosmyna stated that there is no precedent for changing from wood to aluminum fascia. Comm. Apt noted that aluminum wrapped fascia is different than aluminum siding. PC Staff stated that they received one objection of the use of aluminum product from the community. Mr. Madrigal single family residences would be held to the same standard? Yes, it would be the same standard.

Action:

Motion to disapprove Installation of Aluminum Siding over Existing Wood Fascia. -
Comm. Kovacks, Second: Comm. Alvitre.

VOTE: YAY (7) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (0)

2. OWE-117-25 – 2158 Collingwood – Install New Gutters

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Install New Gutters
Location	-	2158 Collingwood
Owner	-	Beal Properties LLC 2200 Commonwealth Blvd, Suite 2 Ann Arbor, MI 48105

Site Description

Zoning	-	RM36 / Multi Dwelling Residential
Frontage	-	264' on Collingwood 170' on Bancroft
Use	-	Vacant Church
Year Built	-	1921

Parcel History

OWE-71-04	–	Repair Overhang (Admin Approved 11/3/04)
-----------	---	--

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to install new gutter on the outside of the building with downspouts on all facades. The applicant asserts that the building currently collects stormwater via an internal gutter system that is drained internally through the building. The internal downspouts are routed within the walls behind plaster and are rotten and leaking. As a result, the applicant indicates the only option to drain stormwater is to utilize an exterior collection system. Staff has concerns that an exterior collection system would change the historic appearance of the building.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§11.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to install aluminum siding over existing wood fascia at 2115 Collingwood, staff objects to the application as proposed due to the use of aluminum products within the overlay district.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission disapprove OWE-117-25, a request to install new gutter on the outside of the building with downspouts on all facades at 2158 Collingwood for the following reason:

1. The proposed alteration of the historic façade would detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.

Discussion: The applicant (Mr. Portales, representing Beal Properties) was present. Mr. Beal explained that they would like to replace the existing internal gutter system with an external system. The current system is failing and is causing water damage. Mr. Portales confirmed that they have not experienced flooding. Discussion surrounding the logistics of adding an external gutter system occurred. PC Staff stated that the property currently has a clay tile roof and the roof line would need to be extended to add an external gutter system. Comm. Kosmyna explained that creating an external gutter system would require significant alteration to the roof and the submitted application makes no mention of altering the roof. Mr. Portales said that he would hire a licensed professional to help with a solution to adding the external gutters. Comm.

Apt noted that adding external gutters is a significant change to the structure and suggested replacing/repairing the existing internal gutter system would be historically appropriate.

Comm. Alvitre suggested having the current cast iron pipes re-lined. Mr. Gleason commented that external gutters would not look right on the property and that he may have a contact for repairing the internal gutters.

Action:

Motion to disapprove Installation of New Gutters. - Comm. Latta, Second: Comm. Alvitre.

VOTE: YAY (7) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (0)

3. OWE-119-25 – 2035 Collingwood – Porch Repairs, Masonry Repairs, Trim Replacement and Basement Door Replacement

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Porch Repairs, Masonry Repairs, Trim Replacement and Basement Door Replacement
Location	-	2035 Collingwood
Owner	-	Corey Hilmas 630 Woods Hollow Ln Powell, OH 43065

Site Description

Zoning	-	RS6 / Single Family Residential
Frontage	-	162' on Collingwood
Use	-	Single Family Dwelling
Year Built	-	1877

Parcel History

OWE-193-23	–	New Storm Windows (Comm Approved 3/11/24)
OWE-187-22	–	Repair Roof and Missing Tiles (Admin Approved 11/14/22)
OWE-126-20	–	Repair Slate Roof (Admin Approved 7/30/20)
OWE-67-16	–	Replace Gutters and Downspouts (Admin Approved 8/15/16)
OWE-53-11	–	Repair Slate Roof (Admin Approved 10/25/11)
OWE-52-05	-	Repair Front Porch and Portico (Admin Approved 7/21/05)
OWE-16-02	-	ADA Ramp (Comm Approved 4/8/02)
OWE-87-01	-	Partial Slate Roof Replacement (Admin Approved 1/14/02)
OWE-10-95	-	Demo of Motel (Comm Approved 5/8/95)
OWE-77-85	-	Building Addition to Carriage House (Comm Approved 12/11/95)

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to remove the existing metal supports attached to handrail and replace with the metal supports with wooden posts. The new wood posts include trim that will be incorporated into the existing railing. The applicant is proposing to demo the front porch lattice and pour a footer to support masonry. The applicant is anticipating to reuse the existing stone and use block and/or bricks for second course of masonry behind stone. The carriage house has spalling brick that will be replaced by bricks sourced from the front porch. The porch repair will include the use of putty or the fabrication of new pieces if rot has destroyed the integrity of the trim. Finally, the work will include the replacement of the exterior basement door. The proposed door will be made of wood materials in the same design and style as the exiting basement door. The applicant is also proposing to reuse the existing hinges.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§111.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to make porch repairs, masonry repairs, trim replacement and basement door replacement that are consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay at 2035 Collingwood, staff supports the application as proposed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-119-25, a request to make porch repairs, masonry repairs, trim replacement and basement door replacement at 2035 Collingwood for the following reasons:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
2. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines, which encourages rehabilitation and preservation whenever possible in the overlay.

Discussion: Judy Stone was present to make the applicant's request for porch repairs, masonry repairs, trim replacement, and basement door replacement at 2035 Collingwood. Ms. Stone confirmed that her client would like to repair and replace damaged and rotted wood with wood, maintain current dimensionality. Ms. Stone noted that they would have pieces milled, if necessary, but are interested in using treated lumber. Comm. Kosmyna agreed that treated lumber was not an issue. Comm. Apt inquired if the applicant planned on replacing the metal support, shown on page 3-7, with wood. The metal support is original to the house and should remain. The applicant agreed to retaining the metal support. From the photos it is unclear if the metal support rests on or behind the wood railing. If it is currently sitting on the wood rail, the commissioners are concerned about the weight load on the balustrade and it will need added support. Additional porch repairs are to be made to the side and rear stairs. The side stairs are to be rebuilt as is. Comm. Kovacs noted that railings will need to be added to the rear stairs to be code compliant. The stonewall will be disassembled, interior brick layer will be removed and replaced, the original brick will be used for masonry repair on the front porch and carriage house as needed. The stonewall will then be reassembled. Comm. Apt noted that the mortar will need to match existing and also that deteriorated bricks can often be turned around and reused. The rebuild of the basement door will use like material in the same design and will reuse the existing hinges. Ms. Hernandez complimented the proposed repairs made by Ms. Stone aware of the groundhog problem in the area.

Action:

Motion to approve as presented, with the caveat that all wood is to match existing wood, trim is to match existing trim, mortar shall be comparative in color and material, center metal column is to remain. - Comm.

Second: Comm. Latta

VOTE: YAY (7) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (0)

4. OWE-121-25 – 616 Acklin – Porch Repairs and Railings

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Porch Repairs and Railings
Location	-	616 Acklin
Owner	-	Warren (Tom) Roseland 616 Acklin Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RS6 / Single Family Residential
Frontage	-	40' on Acklin
Use	-	Single Family Dwelling
Year Built	-	1912

Parcel History

OWE-72-22	–	Repair Wood Siding (Admin Approved 5/23/22)
OWE-93-17	–	Roof Repair (Comm Approved 8/18/17)
OWE-89-05	–	Reroof with Like Materials (Admin Approved 10/23/03)

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- Old West End Historic District Design Guidelines
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to disassemble the front porch and pour a new concrete foundation. Work will include replacing rotten wood as needed using like materials. Staff anticipates the porch rebuild to include work to the stringers, support posts and decking. In addition, the top front porch header will need reinforced. The proposed work also includes the reassembly of the front porch steps in the same footprint using the existing or like materials. The porch steps work includes a side panel to be installed on each side of the steps. The applicant did not provide details on the side panels. Finally, the applicant is proposing wrought iron handrails to be installed on the steps.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§11.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to make porch repairs and install new handrails that are consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay at 616 Acklin, staff supports the application as proposed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-121-25, a request to make porch repairs and install new handrails at 616 Acklin for the following reasons:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
2. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines, which encourages rehabilitation and preservation whenever possible in the overlay.

Discussion: The applicant's representative, Jim Roseland, was present. The applicant is requesting approval to repair and replace the front porch steps. Work will include disassembling the porch and pouring a new concrete foundation, repair or replace lumber with equivalent wood, reassemble steps, add wrought iron railings, and install side panels. Comm. Apt received confirmation from Mr. Roseland that the applicant plans on replacing wood for

wood. PC Staff expressed concern that the addition of side panels sounds like a full porch enclosure, anything other a lattice side panel will require commission review.

Action:

Motion to approve application to make porch repairs and install new handrails be approved as submitted with the caveat that the use of side panel be lattice. If applicant would like a different material, commission review will be required. - Comm. Alvitre

Second: Comm. Latta

Abstain: Comm. Roseland

VOTE: YAY (6) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (1)

5. OWE-122-25 – 2253 Ashland – Install New Shed for Urban Agriculture

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Install a New Shed for Urban Agriculture
Location	-	2253 Ashland
Owner	-	Twanda Harris 7 Tremain Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RM36 / Multi Dwelling Residential
Frontage	-	80' on Ashland 95' on Tremain
Use	-	Undeveloped
Year Built	-	NA

Parcel History

OWE-47-13	–	Install Fence (Comm Approved 8/12/13)
OWE-2-08	–	Demo of Building (Comm Approved 3/13/08)
OWE-4-03	–	Various Repairs (Admin Approved 3/4/03)

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- Old West End Historic District Design Guidelines
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to install a new shed on the property located at 2253 Ashland. The applicant is proposing to use the site for urban agriculture purposes. There are two categories of urban agriculture pursuant to the TMC. Minor Urban Agriculture is defined as the land, farming, truck gardening, forestry, tree farming or community gardens, used to raise flowers, shrubs, and plants for sale. Structures may be used for growing but shall not exceed four-hundred square feet (400 ft²) in total area. The applicant is proposing open garden beds and the shed on-site. The proposed shed will be wood construction and sited on the rear corner of the site, ten (10') feet from both the rear and side property lines.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§11.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to install a new shed at 2253 Ashland, staff supports the application as proposed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-122-25, a request to install a new shed at 2253 Ashland for the following reasons:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
2. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines, which encourages rehabilitation and preservation whenever possible in the overlay.

Discussion: The applicant was present and requests to install a new 10' x 10' shed for Urban Agriculture. Her desire is to create a beautiful garden area for the neighborhood. The shed will sit 60' from the street and comply with city setback requirements. Comm. Kosmyna inquired about the shed's roof material and whether it will sit on a pad or footers. It will be a metal roof and will sit on piers. The shed will be located in the rear corner of the lot and will not block view. Comm. Apt inquired if a sidewalk was planned, Ms. Harris said that she does not have plans to build a sidewalk to the shed. PC Staff inquired about the intent of the shed, does the applicant plan to grow and/or sell food, etc.? Ms.

Harris stated that the purpose of the garden is beautification of the neighborhood and to create a zen-like garden space.

Action:

Motion to approve installation of a new shed for Urban Agriculture as submitted. - **Comm. Kovacs; Second: Comm. Alvitre**

VOTE: YAY (7) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (0)

6. OWE-124-25 – 609 Acklin – Rear Porch Repairs, Steps and Handrails

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Replace Rear Porch Steps and Handrails
Location	-	609 Acklin
Owner	-	609 Acklin LTD 2110 Scottwood Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RS6 / Single Family Residential
Frontage	-	30' on Acklin
Use	-	Single Family Dwelling
Year Built	-	1897

Parcel History

OWE-125-25	–	Changes to OWE-76-24 (Companion Case)
OWE-126-25	–	New Awning Over Rear Door (Companion Case)
OWE-35-24	–	Emergency Foundation Repairs (Admin Approved 4/3/24)
OWE-60-24	–	Porch and Window Repairs (Admin Approved 5/20/24)
OWE-76-24	–	New Driveway, Walkway and Patio (Comm Approved 6/10/24)
OWE-126-24	–	Replace Gutters and Downspouts (Admin Approved 8/30/24)
OWE-119-17	–	Trim and Wood Repair (Admin Approved 10/12/17)
OWE-6-12	–	Porch Steps (Comm Approved 4/9/12)
OWE-40-12	–	Repair Porch Column and Foundation (Comm Approved 9/10/12)

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- Old West End Historic District Design Guidelines
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to replace the existing unfinished rear steps with new steps that includes a four (4') foot deep top landing. The step design will include two (2) steps and the landing. The proposed handrails will be constructed to match the front porch railing designs. The porch/steps will be decked with Azek Timbertech 3.125" lounge and groove planks.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§11.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to replace the rear porch steps and handrails at 609 Acklin, staff supports the application as proposed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-124-25, a request to replace the rear porch steps and handrails at 609 Acklin for the following reasons:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
2. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines, which encourages rehabilitation and preservation whenever possible in the overlay.

Discussion: The applicant was present and requested approval to replace unfinished back steps with a new set that includes a small porch with two steps plus handrails and spindles. Skirting will be either lattice or beadboard. The porch design and materials will mimic the front porch. PC Staff asked for clarification on the width of the top landing; deck width will be between the front window and door frame. Comm. Kosmyna inquired about skirting preference, applicant would prefer lattice.

Action:

Motion to Rear Porch Repairs, Steps and Handrails, with lattice skirting. - Comm. Kovacs
Second: Comm. Ball; Abstain: Comm. Roseland

VOTE: YAY (6) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (1)

7. OWE-125-25 – 609 Acklin – Changes to COA

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Change Material Approved in OWE-76-24 from Concrete to Stone, Paver or Brick
Location	-	609 Acklin
Owner	-	609 Acklin LTD 2110 Scottwood Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RS6 / Single Family Residential
Frontage	-	30' on Acklin
Use	-	Single Family Dwelling
Year Built	-	1897

Parcel History

OWE-124-25	–	Replace Rear Porch Steps and Handrail (Companion Case)
OWE-126-25	–	New Awning Over Rear Door (Companion Case)
OWE-35-24	–	Emergency Foundation Repairs (Admin Approved 4/3/24)
OWE-60-24	–	Porch and Window Repairs (Admin Approved 5/20/24)
OWE-76-24	–	New Driveway, Walkway and Patio (Comm Approved 6/10/24)
OWE-126-24	–	Replace Gutters and Downspouts (Admin Approved 8/30/24)
OWE-119-17	–	Trim and Wood Repair (Admin Approved 10/12/17)
OWE-6-12	–	Porch Steps (Comm Approved 4/9/12)
OWE-40-12	–	Repair Porch Column and Foundation (Comm Approved 9/10/12)

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- Old West End Historic District Design Guidelines
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to modify OWE-76-24 for a ten (10') foot x ten (10') foot patio and two (2') foot wide walkway from concrete to stone, paver or brick. The applicant has yet to determine the material design for the space at the time of this report.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11 11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§1111.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to modify OWE-76-24 for a ten (10') foot x ten (10') foot patio and two (2') foot wide walkway from concrete to stone, paver or brick at 609 Acklin, staff supports the application as proposed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-125-25, a request to modify OWE-76-24 for a ten (10') foot x ten (10') foot patio and two (2') foot wide walkway from concrete to stone, paver or brick at 609 Acklin for the following reason:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.

Discussion: The applicant was present and requested approval to extend COA OWE-76-24 to install a 10'x10' patio on the west side of the rear yard, and a 2' wide walkway in between the driveway and patio. The concrete driveway was installed in July, 2014, but the patio and walkway have not yet been installed. The applicant would like to change the approved concrete walkway/patio to stone, pavers, or brick. The walkway may need to be move a few feet to the south due to the addition of steps when the rear porch is remodeled.

Action:

Motion to approve the request to modify OWE-76-24 for a ten (10') foot x ten (10') foot patio and two (2') foot wide walkway from concrete to stone, paver or brick and move walkway to accommodate steps as necessary. - **Comm. Apt, Second: Comm. Ball; Abstain: Comm. Roseland**

VOTE: YAY (6) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (1)

8. OWE-126-25 – 609 Acklin – Install New Fabric Awning Over Rear Kitchen Door

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Install Fabric Awning over Rear Steps
Location	-	609 Acklin
Owner	-	609 Acklin LTD 2110 Scottwood Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RS6 / Single Family Residential
Frontage	-	30' on Acklin
Use	-	Single Family Dwelling
Year Built	-	1897

Parcel History

OWE-124-25	–	Replace Rear Porch Steps and Handrails (Companion Case)
OWE-125-25	–	Changes to OWE-76-24 (Companion Case)
OWE-35-24	–	Emergency Foundation Repairs (Admin Approved 4/3/24)
OWE-60-24	–	Porch and Window Repairs (Admin Approved 5/20/24)
OWE-76-24	–	New Driveway, Walkway and Patio (Comm Approved 6/10/24)
OWE-126-24	–	Replace Gutters and Downspouts (Admin Approved 8/30/24)
OWE-119-17	–	Trim and Wood Repair (Admin Approved 10/12/17)
OWE-6-12	–	Porch Steps (Comm Approved 4/9/12)
OWE-40-12	–	Repair Porch Column and Foundation (Comm Approved 9/10/12)

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- Old West End Historic District Design Guidelines
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to install a new “Sunbrella” fabric awning over the rear steps. The awning will be wrapped onto an aluminum welded frame in a traditional style look with a scalloped valance. The dimensions of the awning will be approximately 3.5ft x 3 feet with a slope of approximately 2 feet from rear to front.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§11.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant’s proposal to install fabric awning over rear steps at 609 Acklin, staff supports the application as proposed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-126-25, a request to install fabric awning over rear steps at 609 Acklin for the following reason:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.

Discussion: The applicant was present and requested approval to install a new custom fabric awning over rear kitchen door. The awning will be Sunbrella fabric on a welded aluminum frame, approximately 3'7" w x 1'1" h x 3' d.

Action:

Motion to approve installation install fabric awning over rear steps. - **Comm. Alvitre**

Second: Comm. Kovacs

Abstain: Comm. Roseland

VOTE: YAY (6) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (1)

9. OWE-130-25 – 2360 Glenwood – Rear Porch Repairs and New Handrails

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Rear Porch Repairs, Columns, Railings, Fascia and Flooring
Location	-	2360 Glenwood
Owner	-	Dale Snauwaert 2360 Glenwood Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RD6 / Duplex Residential
Frontage	-	50' on Glenwood
Use	-	Single Family Dwelling
Year Built	-	1897

Parcel History

No Parcel History on File.

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- Old West End Historic District Design Guidelines
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to make rear porch repairs. Work includes the replacement of the columns, railings, fascia and flooring. The replacement work will provide the porch a more historically appropriate appearance with detailed columns and railings that are in the Victorian design. Additional work includes the fascia replacement and new decking. The fascia and decking is anticipated to be like-for-like material and design.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§11.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to make rear porch repairs including columns, railings, fascia and flooring at 2360 Glenwood, staff supports the application as proposed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-130-25, a request to make rear porch repairs including columns, railings, fascia and flooring at 2360 Glenwood for the following reasons:

2. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
3. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines, which encourages rehabilitation and preservation whenever possible in the overlay.

Discussion: Applicant was not present.

Action:

Motion to defer applicant's request to make rear porch repairs - Comm. Kovacs

Second: Comm. Alvitres

VOTE: YAY (7) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (0)

10.OWE-131-25 – 2154 Parkwood – Install New Fence

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Install New Fence
Location	-	2154 Parkwood
Owner	-	Krista Bowers 2154 Parkwood Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RD6 / Duplex Residential
Frontage	-	70' on Parkwood 150' on Bancroft
Use	-	Single Family Dwelling
Year Built	-	1907

Parcel History

OWE-83-25	–	Tuckpoint around Basement Window (Admin Approved 6/23/25)
-----------	---	---

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- Old West End Historic District Design Guidelines
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to install a 40" tall metal "no dig" fence along the entire perimeter of the property with the exception of the rear property line where a six (6') foot fence is present. The fence will also border the driveway. The application indicates two (2) gates up the driveway to provide access to the sidewalk and the lawn. The fence appears to be a metal fence with piked tops painted black.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§1111.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

Based on the applicant's proposal to install a 40" tall metal "no dig" fence at 2154 Parkwood, staff supports the application as proposed

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-131-25, a request to install a 40" tall metal "no dig" fence at 2154 Parkwood for the following reasons:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
2. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines.

Discussion: Thelma Bowers was present representing the applicant's request to install a 40" tall metal "no dig" fence along the entire perimeter of the property with the exception of the rear property line where a six (6') foot fence is present. The fence will also border the driveway. The application indicates two (2) gates up the driveway to provide access to the sidewalk and the lawn. Comm. Kosmyna requested clarification on the type of fencing and if the gates will match. The applicant confirmed they will use a black metal no-dig fencing, the 40" fencing will have a decorative top, the 6' will not have the decorative top, and the gates will match. Comm. Apt inquired if the 6' fence would be visible from the front yard, it will not. Discussion followed on whether or not the City Municipal Code would allow proposed section of 6' fencing. Comm. Kosmyna noted that this Commission only approves material and design, if the 6' section is not allowed by the City Municipal Code they applicant can present an exemption request to the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Action:

Motion to approve installation of six (6) downspouts with the specification that there will be a downspout on the southeast corner. - Comm. Apt

Second: Comm. Ball; Abstain: Comm. Roseland

VOTE: YAY (6) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (1)

11.OWE-132-25 – 2200 Scottwood #305 – Install New Aluminum Clad Windows

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Install New Aluminum Clad Windows
Location	-	2200 Scottwood, Unit 305
Owner	-	Pam Weirauch 2200 Scottwood #305 Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RM36 / Multi Dwelling Residential
Frontage	-	177' on Scottwood 223' on Bancroft
Use	-	Residential
Year Built	-	1929

Parcel History

No Parcel History on File.

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to install new aluminum clad windows in Unit 305 of the Ann Manor building located at 2200 Scottwood. Unit 305 is an interior courtyard facing unit. The existing windows appear to be inoperable and the applicant would like to install the same windows as the neighbor. The neighbors' windows were granted COA approval and installed in 2025. Most applications in the Ann Manor building were aluminum, aluminum clad or wood. The proposed aluminum clad windows are consistent with the Old West End Design Guidelines and the Overlay District.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§1111.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-132-25, a request to install new aluminum clad windows at the property at 2200 Scottwood, unit 305 for the following reasons:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
2. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines.

Discussion: The applicant was present and requested to install new aluminum clad windows in Unit 305 of the Ann Manor building located at 2200 Scottwood. The windows will be 6 over 6 double hung with the muntins between the glass. The windows will be the dimensions and color as the current windows. PC Staff noted that Unit 305 is an interior courtyard facing unit. Ms. Weirauch and PC Staff also noted that these windows previously received COA approval in a neighboring unit in this building. Comm. Apt mentioned that it would be helpful to have section dimensions (tape measure on the window) to see how far set in from the trim and brick work. She also inquired if the windows would fit into the masonry, they will.

Action:

Motion to approve installation of New Aluminum Clad Windows as submitted. - Comm. Kovacs

Second: Comm. Ball

VOTE: YAY (7) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (0)

12.OWE-133-25 – 2200 Scottwood #313 – Install New Aluminum Clad Windows

GENERAL INFORMATION

Subject

Request	-	Install New Aluminum Clad Windows
Location	-	2200 Scottwood, Unit 313
Owner	-	Lucia Fitzgerald 2200 Scottwood #313 Toledo, OH 43620

Site Description

Zoning	-	RM36 / Multi Dwelling Residential
Frontage	-	177' on Scottwood 223' on Bancroft
Use	-	Residential
Year Built	-	1929

Parcel History

No Parcel History on File.

Applicable Plans, Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code (T.M.C.), Part 11, Planning and Zoning Code, Chapter 1103.0300 - Historic Overlay Districts, Chapter 1111.1100 Certificates of Appropriateness
- U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, Windows.

STAFF ANALYSIS

This request is to install new aluminum clad windows in Unit 313 of the Ann Manor building located at 2200 Scottwood. Unit 313 is a street/exterior facing unit. The existing windows appear to be inoperable and the applicant would like to install the same windows as the neighbor. The neighbors' windows were granted COA approval and installed in 2025. Most applications in the Ann Manor building were aluminum, aluminum clad or wood. The proposed aluminum clad windows are consistent with the Old West End Design Guidelines and the Overlay District.

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness (C.O.A) because as stated in TMC§11.1101 "no contractor, owner or other person may make any environmental changes to any property designated as a historic landmark or within a designated historic district unless a valid written C.O.A has been issued by the respective Historic District Commission in accordance with the procedures of TMC§1111.1100".

The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.

The building site is located in a designated historic district and consists of a historic building or buildings, structures, and associated landscape features and their relationship within a designed or legally-defined parcel of land. A site may be significant in its own right or because of its association with the historic building or buildings. The U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the building site that are important in defining its overall historic character. Site features may include walls, fences, or steps; circulation systems, such as walls, paths, or roads. Retaining the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape is also recommended. The Standards and Guidelines does not recommend altering buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. The request is in direct conflict with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Buildings.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The staff recommends that the Old West End Historic District Commission approve OWE-133-25, a request to install new aluminum clad windows at the property at 2200 Scottwood, unit 313 for the following reasons:

1. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Overlay and is not anticipated to detract from the historic nature of the Old West End.
2. The proposed work is consistent with the Old West End Historic District Guidelines.

Discussion: The applicant was present and requested to install new aluminum clad windows in Unit 313 of the Ann Manor building located at 2200 Scottwood. The applicant will be using the same windows as discussed in OWE-132-25. The windows will be 6 over 6 double hung with the muntin's between the glass. The windows will be the dimensions and color as the current windows, and will fit into the masonry. Comm. Apt inquired if there was a typo in the application on page 12-3, the application should read "Windows are 33" by 56.5" with a rough opening of 33.75" by 57.1."

Action:

Motion to approve installation of New Aluminum Clad Windows as submitted. - Comm. Alvitre

Second: Comm. Ball

VOTE: YAY (7) NAY (0) ABSTAIN (0)

Secretary Report: Reminder that next month's meeting will be on TUESDAY, October 14th due to Columbus Day.

Other Discussion: Mr. Chuck Madrigal had initiated an online application on August 14th and did not realize that the submittal was not complete nor reviewed by PC Staff for this hearing. Mr. Madrigal presented his request for approval to install a 6' wood, board on board, stockade fence in his rear yard to help secure his property after several break-ins. After discussion it was determined that this COA request could be reviewed and approved administratively.

PC Staff shared that per the TMC and legal department that applications may receive on deferral, if the applicant does not attend the second meeting, the Commission can disapprove the application. If an application is unable to be approved due to lack of quorum, a special meeting can be held to allow the case to be heard within the 45-day allotted time frame, or else the inaction will be interpreted as a recommendation of approval or a decision to approve.

Adjournment: 7:25 p.m.
